



EMC PLANNING GROUP INC.
A LAND USE PLANNING & DESIGN FIRM

301 Lighthouse Avenue Suite C Monterey California 93940
Tel 831-649-1799 Fax 831-649-8399 www.emcplanning.com

To: Christine Hopper, Planning Services Manager
From: Polaris Kinison Brown, Principal Planner
Cc:
Date: October 15, 2019

Re: Vision and Goals Memo

Dear Christy:

This memo is intended to summarize the Vision and Goals component of the City of Marina Coastal Hazards Local Coastal Program (LCP) update. The vision, goals, and strategies developed during this process will serve to guide and inform the development of the LCP coastal hazards policies and implementation measures.

Background

The City of Marina's Local Coastal Program (LCP) was certified by the California Coastal Commission in 1982. Since that time, various amendments have been made but a comprehensive review of the program has not been accomplished to date. In addition, the current LCP does not consider sea level rise impacts or provide adaptation policies; a priority issue of the California Coastal Commission as demonstrated by Goal 3 of the Commission's Strategic Plan (CCC 2013a), which is to "address climate change through LCP planning, coastal permitting, inter-agency collaboration, and public education."

In 2017, the City was awarded an \$85,685 grant from the California Coastal Commission to complete a focused update to the LCP to address coastal hazards associated with sea-level rise. The update includes a vulnerability and risk assessment, identification of adaptation strategies,

MEMORANDUM

and development of policy and implementation consistent with the California Coastal Commission's priorities and the City's General Plan.

Coastal Act LCP Requirements

Coastal legislation was initiated in 1976, when the state legislature passed the California Coastal Act of 1976 (Coastal Act). The Coastal Act requires each coastal city and county to prepare a Local Coastal Program that establishes the kind, location, and intensity of land and water uses appropriate to its portion of the Coastal Zone. The Coastal Act is part of the state's Public Resources Code, beginning at §30000. Local Coastal Program policies and standards, are intended to reflect and carry out the coastal resources planning and management policies contained in Chapter 3 of the Coastal Act (Public Resources Code §30200). The basic goals of the Coastal Act, as stated in Public Resources Code §30001.5, are as follows:

- Protect, maintain, and where feasible, enhance and restore the overall quality of the Coastal Zone environment and its natural and man-made resources.
- Assure orderly, balanced utilization and conservation of the Coastal Zone resources taking into account the social and economic needs of the people of the state.
- Maximize public access to and along the coast, and maximize public recreation opportunities in the Coastal Zone consistent with sound resource conservation principles and constitutionally protected rights of private property owners.
- Ensure priority for coastal-dependent development and coastal-related development over other development on the coast.
- Encourage state and local initiatives and cooperation in preparing procedures to implement coordinated planning and development for mutually beneficial uses, including educational uses, in the Coastal Zone.

LCPs establish the kinds, locations, and intensities of new development allowed in the coastal zone, and identify other development standards necessary to achieve the objectives of the Coastal Act.

State Law

The *California Coastal Commission Sea Level Rise Policy Guidance* (California Coastal Commission 2018) identifies four categories of principles, many of which derive directly from the requirements of the Coastal Act, that provide a framework for addressing sea level rise in LCPs:

- Use science to guide decisions;
- Minimize coastal hazards through planning and development standards;
- Maximize protection of public access, recreation, and sensitive coastal resources; and
- Maximize agency coordination and public participation.

The principals listed above represent the Coastal Commission “goals to which actions should aspire.” These principals can be utilized to inform the City’s coastal hazards and sea level rise vision and goals.

Coastal Act LCP Vision, Goals, and Strategies

The development of a vision, goals, and strategies (described below) serve to guide development of policies and implementation measures that will form the basis of the LCP. These examples of a vision, goals, and strategies can be utilized to inform the City’s coastal hazards and sea level rise vision and goals.

Vision

The visioning process produces a statement articulating the community’s preferred future. The vision statement represents the community’s desired “destination” – a shared image of where it would like to be in the long term. An example vision statement consistent with the basic goals of the Coastal Act (PRC Section 30001.5) is provided below.

Example Vision Statement

The Coastal Zone is a unique and valuable resource where:

- The quality of the coastal zone environment and its natural and artificial resources are protected, maintained, and where feasible, enhanced;

- There is an orderly, balanced utilization and conservation of coastal zone resources taking into account the social and economic needs of the community and the people of the state;
- There is coordinated planning and development for mutually beneficial uses, including educational uses, in the coastal zone;
- Public access and public recreational opportunities to and along the coast is maximized, with consideration of sound resource conservation principles and private property rights;
- Coastal-dependent development and coastal-related development is a priority over other development on the coast; and
- Planning and development for mutually beneficial uses, including educational uses, is encouraged.

This example vision statement articulates the Coastal Act direction to meet the basic goals of the Coastal Act. The City of Marina is unique, and its vision statement (while maintaining the intent of the Coastal Act) must be reflective of their independent collective image of their coast going into the future.

Goals

Specific goals provide the framework for reaching the overall vision. Examples of some generalized goals that support the example vision statement above are provided below.

EXAMPLE GOAL 1: Prepare a Local Coastal Program (LCP) that addresses Coastal Act priorities and is consistent with City goals.

EXAMPLE GOAL 2: Obtain Coastal Commission certification of the Local Coastal Program.

Strategies

Strategies are statements of means to achieve a goal.

EXAMPLE STRATEGY 1: Secure a Coastal Commission Grant by December 2019 to update the City's current LCP.

The City of Marina Focused LCP Update

The purpose of the City of Marina focused LCP update is to address coastal hazards and sea level rise. Factors that inform the City's LCP update include:

- Vision and Goals adopted by the City (the City's General Plan and LCP);
- State Law - California Coastal Act, Coastal Commission Guidance;
- Technical Analysis (*City of Marina Existing Conditions and Sea Level Rise Issues Report*, Revell Coastal 2019);
- Joint Planning Commission/City Council Public Workshops;
- Stakeholder Meetings; and
- Community input including direct communications and an on-line questionnaire.

The inputs listed above will be used to develop the new Coastal Hazards section of the City's LCP Land Use Plan (LUP) and Implementation Plan (IP). The LUP, which outlines policies, and the IP, which provides implementing measures for the policies, together constitute the LCP.

City of Marina Current Vision and Goals Focused on Coastal Hazards and Sea Level Rise

The City's General Plan and current LCP contain some guidance as to community values and what is important in the face of coastal hazards and sea level rise. Relevant policies within these two documents are presented below.

General Plan

General Plan Vision Statement

Marina desires to grow and mature, along with its image, from a small town, primarily bedroom community, to become a small city which is diversified, vibrant and mostly self-sufficient. The City can and will accomplish this by achieving both the necessary level and diversity of jobs, economic activity, public services, housing, and civic life (including culture and recreation), and parks and open space.

General Plan Goals

Specific goals within the City's General Plan that are relevant to the focused LCP update include:

Community Goal 1.18

(2.) Community development which avoids or minimizes to the greatest extent possible the consumption or degradation of non-renewable natural resources including natural habitats, water, energy, and prime agricultural land.

(13) Ample opportunities for outdoor recreation for all residents, both within their immediate neighborhoods, elsewhere in the city, and in the immediate environs.

Local Coastal Program

Specific policies within the current LCP that are relevant to the focused LCP update include:

Policy 8. To prohibit further degradation of the beach environment and conserve its unique qualities.

Access Component

2. To provide beach access and recreational opportunities consistent with public safety and with the protection of the rights of the general public and of private property owners.

3. To provide beach access in conjunction with the new development where it is compatible with public safety, military security and natural resources protection; and does not duplicate similar access nearby.

Existing Conditions Evaluation

The 2019 *City of Marina Existing Conditions and Sea Level Rise Issues Report* (Revell Coastal 2019) (Existing Conditions and Sea Level Rise Issues report) will form the technical basis for the focused LCP update. The Existing Conditions and Sea Level Rise Issues report provides a science-based vulnerability assessment that considers potential impacts from coastal hazards exacerbated by various elevations of sea level rise to a wide range of infrastructure and natural

resource sectors. The report also identifies potential adaptation strategies to reduce the risk and exposure to these sectors through time while acknowledging the secondary effects of some of these potential strategies.

Vulnerabilities

Five infrastructure and natural resource sectors were evaluated for vulnerabilities in the Existing Conditions and Sea Level Rise Issues report:

- Land Use and Parkland.
- Trails and Access.
- Water Supply and Wastewater.
- Roads, Parking, and Bike Routes.
- Dune Habitat.

The report also identifies potential adaptation strategies to reduce the risk and exposure to these sectors through time while acknowledging the secondary effects of some of these potential strategies.

Key Vulnerability Findings

The following are key findings identified as a result of analyses in the Existing Conditions and Sea Level Rise Issues report:

- Coastal dune erosion hazards are the biggest threat to the City of Marina, with potentially up to five feet of sea level rise. The primary impact from this erosion is to open space and dune habitats.
- One sewer pump station, one visitor serving resort, one groundwater supply well, an (aging/ phasing out) water treatment facility and the coastal access and associated parking lot at Marina State Park are the key vulnerabilities in the City to projected coastal erosion.
- With five feet of sea level rise and a one percent annual chance storm, there is a chance that additional areas near the Reservation Road underpass in the City could be temporarily impacted.

Positive Findings

- Reduction of erosion rates from cessation of sand mining is expected to reduce the risk of sea level rise impacts to the City.
- No projected erosion impacts to any residential, mixed use, or commercial land uses, were identified.
- Currently the City has no coastal armoring.

Adaptation

According to the Coastal Commission, sea level rise adaptation generally falls into five main categories: do nothing, protect, accommodate, retreat, or a hybrid approach. Natural dune erosion from large storm waves is the primary hazard challenging the Marina shoreline. Dune erosion, however, is a natural process that creates and maintains beaches through time even in the face of sea level rise. Dune erosion, wide beaches, and development policies which have largely avoided hazards have proven effective. The imminent stopping of the CEMEX sand mine should also buy more time to adapt by reducing erosion rates. However, as identified in the Existing Conditions and Sea Level Rise Issues report, the goal of any adaptation policy or project in Marina should focus on reducing erosion rates, while allowing natural erosion and shoreline fluctuations to maintain beaches. This provides guidance for defining the City's vision and goals as they relate to coastal hazards and sea level rise.

The adaption discussion within the Existing Conditions and Sea Level Rise Issues report provides additional detail and specific policy recommendations that may be utilized to develop specific LCP polices and implementation.

Public Input

Joint Planning Commission/City Council Public Workshops

A set of draft vision and goals was presented at a City Council joint public workshop with the Planning Commission on June 13, 2019. The purpose of the meeting was to present draft statements to help guide the development of the City's vision with regard to sea level rise and coastal erosion, and goals related to that vision.

A revised set of draft vision and goals was presented at a City Council joint public workshop with the Planning Commission on September 12, 2019. Comments on the revisions were taken from the members of the Planning Commission and City Council, and one member of the public. All comments received were considered in drafting the final set of vision and goals.

Stakeholder Meetings

City staff and their LCP update consultants met with individual stakeholders on July 29, 2019. Identified stakeholders included State Parks, the Sanctuary Beach Resort, and Marina Coast Water District (MCWD). Key points from each of the three meetings are listed below.

State Parks

- State Parks has been in communication with the City of Monterey regarding nourishment. The City LCP Update team would be speaking to this issue at the next workshop and would extend an invitation to State Parks to attend.
- Parking area has been affected by stormwater flooding and erosion. Access points in particular have been affected. Parking lot has never been overtopped by waves. Need to address stormwater issue.
- Since 2006 State Parks estimates they have lost approximately 10 feet of dunes.
- The State Parks Department needs to address sea level rise and prioritize what is needed for managed retreat. Restrooms were built in 2012. May need alternate location for restrooms. State Parks has not yet developed a priority matrix.
- State Parks Planning: 75-80 year estimated life of structures (e.g. restrooms). Estimated 10 year lead time for plans, permitting, implementation, construction, etc. of structures.
- Unsure if there is an access easement between State Parks and MCWD.
- There has been discussion about MCWD transferring buildings to State Parks. They may do it if buildings were removed and restoration done. Need to work with MCWD.
- The State Parks general plan dated. Needs to be updated. Plan to address erosion issues could be addressed in an update.
- State Parks does not do any kind of monitoring of dune erosion for Marina.

- Sand Replenishment? If sand is clean, may take from projects such as CSUMB, Seahaven, Dunes, Marina Station, etc.
- Triggers are important. When does State Parks close the parking lot? Currently they just corner off parts of the lot when they fail, until those locations are repaired.
- August 23rd is the next State Parks management meeting. We will get comments back from State Parks after that meeting.
- Planned campground for the Marina State Beach has been requested by the public.
- State Parks has heard the following comments: Not enough parking. Too crowded. Motorhomes stay parked all day. Support for charging a fee.

Sanctuary Beach Resort

- Coastal Commission has retained permit authority over the Sanctuary Beach Resort.
- As part of the permit for the Sanctuary Resort– no armoring is allowed.
- Dr. Revell of the City’s LCP team has shared that with cessation of sand mining – an approximate 70 percent reduction in erosion rates. Even with that reduction in erosion rates, there are still areas at risk. Beach Nourishment may be an option.
- Currently the Sanctuary Beach Resort has plans for renovating the most oceanfront rooms (the ones most at risk). Room renovations occur on a 5-7 year timeline. The cost/benefit is factored into planning.
- The Sanctuary Beach Resort has current plans for expansion.
- The Sanctuary Beach Resort consists of the hotel (under control of the resort) and multiple timeshare properties. The timeshare properties are set farther back from the coastline than resort guestrooms. The Sanctuary Beach Resort (hotel) works well with the timeshare company.
- Options: Consider location of future buildings as part of the expansion. May want to locate them farther from the ocean. Most infill areas within the Resort footprint are ESHA. There may be a case that can be presented to the Coastal Commission for impacting “secondary ESHA” (infill areas away from the beach) vs. impacting oceanfront ESHA. This achieves two things: 1. Protecting oceanfront ESHA; and 2. setting the resort buildings farther away from the ocean for protection against hazards.

This may require mapping primary vs. secondary ESHA. City staff mentioned that this approach has been taken previously.

- May be able to build fewer new buildings with increased height to achieve the same occupancy.

Marina Coast Water District

- Current buildings are all used as offices.
- MCWD has other facilities and has considered moving administration to those facilities.
- In mid 1990s the tanks were decommissioned when the regional plant was opened.
- There have been many long, difficult conversations about what to do with this facility. No remediation plan currently. Any remediation plan would be long term.
- Several plans are in process: Infrastructure Master Plan is almost complete. Draft water supply, sewer and recycled water master plans. No sea level rise or erosion considerations are in these documents.
- Former wastewater treatment plant, with tanks and test location for desalination and an inactive capped well, currently in the beach and rarely exposed (uncovered with sand).
- The offices appear as several separate buildings, but have been connected. Unsure of what the foundation type is.
- Will need to coordinate with State Parks and the City to identify needs, strategies, and alternate locations.
- Request meeting with State Parks and the City to coordinate.

On-Line Questionnaire

A questionnaire was posted to the City's Local Coastal Program update webpage in early July 2019. As of July 24, 2019 the City had received four completed questionnaires from the public (all residents). The following summarizes input from the community that may be helpful in refining the City's vision and goals.

Likes/Values (Most)

Raw and relatively "untouched / undeveloped" nature of our beaches

Proximity to home

The diversity and small town feeling

Likes/Values (Least)

When outside entities damage our coastline

Limited access

Too much government control limiting public access

Amenities that "Define" Marina's Coast and Coastal Experience

Raw and unfiltered beaches, with its lack of beach sand grooming, provides beach wrack for many animals

Natural

Ease of access

Recreation, fresh air, easy access to the bay area and to other points along the coast

Biggest Concern Related to Erosion and Coastal Hazards in Marina

Lack of public awareness and education over what coastal erosion is and means to the community

Overreaction - allow the natural process to occur

Safety and sustainability

Challenges

Coastal Stewardship, ensuring that if sea levels rise we do not contribute negative environmental impacts by, for example, allowing harmful debris to wash into the ocean

Collaboration with coastal neighbors (how do we ensure our neighbors don't contribute negative impacts that in turn affect Marina, such as harmful runoff and vice versa

Challenge to continue to educate the population that our coast is special and something worthy of serious protective care measures

Proper allocation of private and public responsibilities

Opportunities

Education and other programs to encourage conservation / care of our coast

Consider any impacts of any future development

Plan for different sea level rise scenarios

The opportunity is to build long term resiliency along the Marina coastline and inland

What Actions Would You Like to See Marina Take to Adapt/Respond to Sea-Level Rise?

Managed Retreat

There appears to be three kinds of threats:

1. To publicly-owned utilities, particularly the Marina Coast Water District. There is at least a 10-year window to move, and in the process upgrade, those facilities. That is a cost that should be borne by district residents, and the residents of any other affected jurisdiction.
2. To publicly owned recreational facilities, and roads that serve them. Plans should be made to adapt those facilities to coastline changes, and implemented over the long term in routine maintenance and development programs.
3. To private property. Property owners should be kept aware of near and long term threats. Responsibility for acting on warnings or threats is solely that of private property owners.

What Do You Think Could be the Consequences of Taking Those Actions?

Push back from landowners, residents/citizens, and business owners.

A just and economically sustainable publicly-funded solution to problems that are legitimately public responsibilities, and freedom for private parties to suffer or prosper as they choose.

City of Marina Coastal Hazards Vision and Goals

Utilizing the inputs discussed above, a set of vision, goals, and strategies have been crafted to help guide development of coastal hazards and sea level rise policies and implementation measures that form the basis of the updated LCP.

City of Marina Vision

VISION: The City of Marina is a vibrant, sustainable coastal town and is committed to protecting and preserving its unique natural coastline and its other valued coastal resources (including accessible beaches, visual quality, groundwater, beach and dune habitat, and diverse population of plants and wildlife including threatened and endangered species) in perpetuity to support a local economy and community identity based on coastal tourism, low impact and affordable recreation, and natural habitats.

VISION: Marina is a leader in improving coastal resiliency, responding to climate change impacts, and adapting to sea level rise and identified coastal hazard risks in a way that protects both its coastal resources and public safety and welfare.

City of Marina Goals

GOAL: Planning and development within the coastal zone is guided by science.

Strategy: Develop policies that require the use of the best available science to determine locally relevant and context-specific sea level rise projections for all stages of planning, project design, and permitting reviews.

GOAL: Marina's natural coastline and other coastal resources are protected and preserved.

GOAL: Respond to climate change impacts in a way that protects coastal resources and public safety and welfare.

GOAL: Adapt to sea level rise and identified coastal hazard risks in a way that protects coastal resources and public safety and welfare.

Strategy: Develop policies and implementation to reduce coastal erosion rates.

Strategy: Prioritize natural erosion and shoreline fluctuations to maintain City and State local beaches.

Strategy: Ban shoreline protective devices in favor of beach replenishment processes and retreat.

Strategy: Prioritize protection and preservation of habitat connectivity between the ocean and the dunes.

Strategy: Work to relocate and accommodate existing land uses that may be impacted by coastal erosion or flooding.

Strategy: Provide leadership and work with regional partners across Southern Monterey Bay, in particular State Parks and the Marina Coast Water District, to ensure that any impacts to sediment supply or facility upgrades consider sea level rise and the City's local beaches.